

## An Investigation of the Adequacies of the Modular Non-Formal Education Programs Run at the Public Training Centers in Turkey

### Halk Eğitimi Merkezlerinde Uygulanmakta Olan Modüler Yetişkin Eğitimi Programlarının Yeterliliklerinin Araştırılması

Ayşegül GÜLTEKİN TOROSLU\*

Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı

#### *Abstract*

Nowadays, technology is developing and changing very rapidly. It is necessary to raise qualified workforce in order to follow this changing technology. Thus, "non-formal education" becomes as important as formal education. In Turkey, Non-Formal Education is mainly carried out by Public Training Centers (PTC) of Ministry of National Education (MONE). For these institutions to achieve their targets, it is necessary to determine the adequacies of the existing modular non-formal education programs. Hence, the purpose of this study is to reveal the adequacies of the modular non-formal education programs executed at the PTCs operating under the MONE. The sample space of this research is made up of administrators, teachers/master trainers and students of PTC's of 2006-2007 school year. A total of 150 administrators, 350 teachers/master trainers and 3500 students are included in the survey who were distributed to the selected provinces based on their relative population sizes. As a result of this study, important information has been collected regarding the adequacies of the programs applied at the PTCs. The results of our questionnaires indicate that except for some issues in general modular programs are quite adequate. In some programs, some improvements are needed especially related to the durations of the programs and the physical environments. As a result of the findings, the necessary policies must be developed to deal with the issues determined as not very satisfactory and to make necessary revisions on the programs based on the results.

*Keywords:* Public training, non-formal education, adult education, program adequacies.

#### *Öz*

Günümüzde teknoloji çok hızlı gelişmekte ve değişmektedir. Bu değişen teknolojiye ayak uydurabilecek insan gücünün yetiştirilmesine ihtiyaç vardır. Bu nedenle "yaygın eğitim" de örgün eğitim gibi çok önem kazanmaktadır. Türkiye'de Yaygın Eğitim genellikle Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı'na (MEB) bağlı Halk Eğitimi Merkezleri (HEM) tarafından yapılmaktadır. Bu kurumların amaçlarına ulaşabilmesi için mevcut modüler yetişkin eğitimi programlarının yeterliliklerinin belirlenmesi gereklidir. Bu araştırma, MEB'e bağlı HEM'lerde uygulanan modüler programların yeterliliklerinin incelenmesi ve sorunların tespit edilerek öneriler sunulmasına yönelik tarama niteliğinde betimsel bir çalışmadır. Araştırmanın çalışma evrenini 2006-2007 eğitim yılında görev yapan yönetici, öğretmen/usta öğretici ve eğitim alan kursiyerler oluşturmaktadır. Seçilen illerin ağırlıklı oranları baz alınarak araştırmada HEM'lerde görev yapan 150 yönetici, 350 öğretmen/usta öğretici ve 3500 öğrenciye ulaşılması hedeflenmiştir. Bu araştırmanın sonucunda HEM'lerde uygulanan programların yeterliliklerine ilişkin önemli sonuçlar elde edilmiştir. Bazı durumlar hariç genelde modüler kurs programlarının oldukça yeterli olduğu görülmüştür. Bazı programlarda özellikle program süreleri ve fiziksel ortamla ilgili bazı düzenlemelerin yapılması gerekliliği ortaya çıkmıştır. Elde edilen bulgular doğrultusunda, yeterli olmadığı tespit edilen konularda yeni politikaların geliştirilmesi ve programlarda uygun revizyonların yapılmasının gerekli olduğu sonucuna varılmıştır.

*Anahtar Sözcükler:* Halk eğitimi, yaygın eğitim, yetişkin eğitimi, program yeterliliği.

\* Dr. Ayşegül GÜLTEKİN TOROSLU, Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, atoroslu@meb.gov.tr,

## Introduction

In order to be able to keep up with fast changing technology, it is necessary to raise qualified work force. Not to be left behind the developing global conditions, “non-formal education” is coming into prominence, besides the formal education. Non-formal education covers all educational activities for the people who have never taken any part in the formal education, for those who are in any level of the formal education or who have left formal education at any level, on the subjects that they show interest in, as well as or completely separate from the formal education (Ministry of Education [MEB], 2006-1). Within the concept of non-formal education, the aim is to give new knowledge and skills to adults so as to provide changes and development in their practices. These non-formal education activities are carried out by the non-governmental organisations, municipalities and by the State (Tampubolon, 2003). In Turkey, PTC working under the Ministry of National Education are fulfilling this function and are aiming to provide non-formal education to people at all ages, at home, at work, at school, anywhere, at any time (Gözütok, 2003). For these institutions to achieve their targets, it is necessary to determine the adequacies of their modular programs developed for non-formal education.

People training activities arise from regional social, cultural, economic and environmental requirements (Tampubolon, 2003). When modular programs are initiated, the requirements of the region and the people have to be taken into account and for initiating courses towards production; decisions have to be taken along the opinions of the trainees. When all related opinions are evaluated, it is seen that it would be useful to determine the courses to be initiated towards employment and for contributing to the social and individual developments and then to make the necessary arrangements for these.

In Turkey, the foundation of the public training is based on “The Law about Acceptance of the Turkish Alphabet and Its Practice” introduced in 1928 (Official Gazette [RG], 1928), together with “The Primary Education and Training Law” introduced in 1961 (Official Gazette [RG], 1961) and “The Basic Law of National Education”, enacted in 1973 (Official Gazette [RG], 1973). Also, as well as the concepts such as everyone being equal in having the rights of receiving education and training and the education and training should be given under the supervision of the state, being present in the 1982 Constitution, it also states in the preamble that, “... it is the birthright of every Turkish citizen to lead an honourable life and to develop his material and spiritual resources under the aegis of national culture, civilization and the rule of law, through the exercise of the fundamental rights and freedoms set forth in this Constitution in conformity with the requirements of equality and social justice” (Official Gazette [RG], 1982). For those individuals who could not benefit from formal education, the non-formal education gives the opportunity to develop their cultural values and to keep up with the innovations and technical developments. It is necessary to enable the adults or the people left out of the formal education system to have access to education and life-long education opportunities in order to provide the same rights to them with the people participated in formal education. Moreover, the education given to such people needs to be different from children not because their cognitive processes are dissimilar but because their education, life context and background of experience is different (Aitchison, 1993). Thus, when educating adults, learning by doing, learning by producing and learning by explaining basic methods have to be considered (UNESCO/UYDEL, 2006). In 17<sup>th</sup> National Education Summit held in 2006, decisions were taken on non-formal education institutions and the ones concerning the PTCs were as follows (Ministry of Education [MEB], 2006-2):

1. The training programs given in the non-formal training centres should reach the international standards,
2. The certificates given at the end of the courses should be at international standards,
3. Activities must be organised to give knowledge to the students and to increase their level of awareness and in defining these activities, regional requirement analysis made by the experts based on the scientific measures should be considered,

4. The physical structure and hardware deficiencies in the Public Training Centres should be eliminated and financial support to these institutions should be provided,

5. More emphasis should be given to the training of the disabled individuals and their unification with the society should be provided,

6. The existing programs should be accredited,

7. Training should not be limited to students and the workers only, emphasis should be given to family training also,

8. More emphasis should be given to training on human rights, democracy and raising environmental awareness.

In the non-formal education centres, besides the social programs such as public health, family planning and inter family communication, political life, cultural values of the community (revival of the customs and the traditions), also vocational programs (handicrafts, agriculture, industrial sector, etc...) are executed to a great extent (Husen & Postlethwaite, 1985). Since the main aim is to develop skills in these programs, applied training, supported by preparation, explanation, show, application, observation, evaluation and correction of the mistakes stages, according to the level of the students, should be given. In this issue, the importance of the programs executed in the courses opened at the PTCs also gain importance. 207 of the programs practiced at the PTCs were renewed within the frame of the Supporting the Basic Education Program and they were restructured into modular programs (Ministry of Education [MEB], 2007). In this investigation made, the modular programs started in 2006-2007 school year in the PTCs were evaluated. The aim of this study is to determine if revisions are needed in these programs.

The training programs not only aim at regular works at the school, but aim at developing living and learning conditions in the society as well (Erden, 1995). For this reason, training programs should be developed by considering problems and the requirements of the society in one hand, whereas the problems of the children and the young people, their interests, development characteristics and needs have to be taken into account on the other hand (Ocak, 2004). When a training program is developed by considering basic program development stages, the training needs of the adults (identification of the training needs-general purposes), determination of the purposes and targets of the program (formation of the contents), organisation of the training events throughout the program to be used, identification of the applications and evaluation works (evaluation and revision of the program according to the results) have to be conceived (Ertürk, 1972; Olivia, 1988). It is not possible to organise the programs executed in the public training centres in a standard format as in the formal education, because the programs need to be flexible and suitable for continuous updating in order to be able to follow technological developments and to answer for the needs and the demands of the adults, who are a part of the society (Demirel, 2004; Ornstein & Hunkins, 1998).

Modular program approach is generally used in vocational training, especially in non-formal education, in the developed countries. Modular approach is more flexible; therefore, it is more suitable for meeting the needs of economic, social and technological changes (Taspinar, 2006). Modular programs are composed of small modules. Each module should be complete and should have a well defined purpose and structure. A modular program is constructed by combining compatible and related modules in a logical structure. In modular programs, trainees may progress with their own pace, and they can be evaluated for each module separately. Therefore, modular programs are appropriate for group of people with different backgrounds and experiences, which is usually the case in non-formal education (Fer, 2000; Cengizhan 2008).

For the public training programs to be able to reach the required target, initially the purposes need to be defined well. The correctly defined route that will be followed, which is compatible with the targets, is also important from the points of identification of the expected results and identification of the contents of the program, choosing the most suitable procedures and techniques for the subjects and the aim, and evaluation of the works. To achieve these aims

in full, the views and suggestions of the people who are involved in this process, including the administrators of PTCs, teachers and more importantly, the trainers who have participated in the training have to be taken. Therefore, the main purpose of this investigation is to determine whether programs achieve their aims, and the expectations of the participants are fulfilled. This requires determining several points, including the adequacies of the resources to be utilized, the procedures / techniques and scheduling the works, units of the modules etc. In other word the state of the programs must be found out based on the views of all the people involved in modular programs executed at PTCs..

In this investigation, it was aimed to measure the adequacies of the modular programs developed for non-formal education and executed in the People Training Centers functioning under the Ministry of National Education, which provides programs for socio-economic, cultural, and individual development of the people who could not complete their formal education (Pratt 1980; Varış 1976) and for obtaining a profession. It was also aimed to assess the current status of the programs executed in the PTCs and to determine if and how they need to be developed. The adequacies of these programs can be measured in terms of the following issues:

- Regarding the programs executed at public training centres;
  - Do they meet the actual need?
  - Are they understandable?
  - Are the description, general aim and the aims of the units of the programs adequate?
  - Do programs reach their targets?
  - Do units of the programs reach their targets?
  - Are the units, daily and individual training programs stated in the modules being made and controlled?
  - Do the equipment lists sufficiently cover the program?
  - Are the modular programs described, executed in the centres?
  - Are the certificates issued at the end of the programs useful for finding jobs?
- Regarding the public training centres;
  - How are their physical structures?
  - Do they have adequate equipment to execute the programs?
  - What criteria's are used in deciding the programs to open in the public training centres?
- Are there other programs offered besides the modular programs described?
- What are the specific courses that have to be offered at the public training centres to meet the needs of the region, or in general which courses are demanded by the students?

The rest of this paper is organized as follows. The next section describes the method used to conduct this investigation. After that, the findings of the study were presented, comparing the responses of three different respondent groups. Finally, the results and the suggestions were presented.

### Method

In order to measure the adequacies of modular programs of PTCs, which are initiated in recent years, questionnaires were developed for the administrators, the teachers, and the students. These questionnaires have two sections. The first section is used to collect demographic information about the respondents, and it has 10 questions for the administrators, 12 questions for the teachers, and 9 questions for the students. The second section is used to gather views of the respondents about modular programs. This section contains 33 questions for the administrators,

# AN INVESTIGATION OF THE ADEQUACIES OF THE MODULAR NON-FORMAL EDUCATION PROGRAMS RUN AT THE PUBLIC TRAINING CENTERS IN TURKEY

40 questions for the teachers, and 36 questions for the students. This survey was first applied to a test group in Ankara, and after it has been revised based on the responses and the comments of the respondents of the test group, it has been finalized and applied to the real survey group.

The investigation was carried out in randomly selected 70 public training centers from 6 different provinces. The number of the master trainers depends on the number of courses offered by public training centers.

The sample space of this research is made up from the administrators, teachers / master trainers and students of PTC's of 2006-2007 school year. 150 administrators, 350 teachers / master trainers and 3500 students, totaling 4000 people, are planned to be included in the survey, distributed to the selected provinces based on their relative population sizes. In the survey conducted 4232 people included. (Ministry of Education [MEB], 2006-2007). The names of the cities that participated in this investigation and the numbers of PTCs, cities, administrators, teachers and students participated in the survey are shown in Table 1.

Table 1.

*The Distribution of the Number of PTCs, Administrators, Teachers / Master Trainers and Students to Cities In the PTCs which form the workspace, surveys were conducted with administrators, teachers and students chosen at random and survey was made with only one teacher from each branch. A five-point Likert scale were used (1= "Strongly Agree", 2="Agree", 3= "Medium Level Agree", 4= "A Little Agree", 5= "Strongly Disagree").*

NAME OF CITY	NO. OF ADMINIS- TRATORS	NO. OF TEACHER/ MASTER TRAINER	NO. OF STUDENTS	TOTAL
ANKARA	41	80	689	810
İSTANBUL	125	164	2130	2419
İZMİR	37	59	341	437
ANTALYA	16	15	251	282
BURSA	16	66	220	302
HATAY	2	3	-	5
TOTAL	237	387	3631	4255

After the collection of the data, statistical analysis was performed excluding missing answers. With statistical analysis, percentage, frequency, Scheffe and T-Tests were applied and the dependency relationships between the variables were also determined. In order to perform these analysis SPSS software program was utilized.

In the following section the findings of this investigation will be presented. Three different surveys are performed on the stakeholders of the PTCs, namely administrators, teachers, and the trainees. The adequacies of the programs are measured by comparing the answers of these three groups on the questionnaires of these surveys. The first survey determines the relationships among the responses of all three groups, and the following three surveys determine the relationships between the responses of three different pairs of groups, specifically trainer-teacher, trainer-administrator, and finally teacher-administrator groups.

## Results

The findings of this study are presented below in four different subsections by also comparing the responses of the groups on which common surveys were applied. These way disagreements among the groups were also determined.

### *Comparison of the Trainee-Administrator-Teacher Opinions*

In the Trainee-Administrator-Teacher surveys, common opinions were received on nine

issues. The results of the variance analyses are shown in Table 2. When the variance analyses table is inspected, it can be seen that the nine common opinions are significant with F values being at a level of 0.000 ( $p < 0.005$ ). In order to determine where the significant differences rooted from, Scheffe test was applied. Since the group numbers were not equal, while Scheffe test was applied, harmonic average was used, and the average range was taken as between 418,975 and 427,990.

Table 2.  
*Results Related to Nine Common Opinions*

		N	$\bar{X}$ (GROUPS)			S.D.	F	p.
			1	2	3			
1) The course is contributing to preparation of the trainees for life as a contemporary individual and as a person with civil consciousness.	Trainee	3536	1,76			1,054		
	Teacher	388		1,55		,778	10,225	,000
	Administrator	241		1,58		,792		
2) While the Modular programs are chosen, the regional requirements are considered.	Trainee	3454	1,93			1,202		
	Teacher	384		1,55		,979	49,865	,000
	Administrator	242			1,29	,555		
3) The programs are initiated along with the demands of the public.	Trainee	3475	1,59			,997		
	Teacher	387		1,39		,754	17,910	,000
	Administrator	240		1,29		,631		
4) The programs are initiated towards production.	Trainee	3431	2,00			1,240		
	Teacher	380	2,01			1,184	11,018	,000
	Administrator	236		2,39		1,039		
5) The programs are initiated along with scientific and technological developments.	Trainee	3441	2,19			1,317		
	Teacher	381	2,11			1,156	9,234	,000
	Administrator	242		1,83		,931		
6) The programs contribute to social and individual development.	Trainee	3508	1,61			,992		
	Teacher	387		1,38		,880	11,154	,000
	Administrator	241	1,48	1,48		,742		
7) The programs add lasting knowledge and skills by making and living.	Trainee	3516	1,40			,764		
	Teacher	382		1,25		,575	8,824	,000
	Administrator	241	1,48			,742		
8) The course times are adhered to, as planned.	Trainee	3527	1,31			,777		
	Teacher	380		2,09		1,971	118,625	,000
	Administrator	240	1,45			,730		
9) The contents of the programs cover scientific and technological developments.	Trainee	3437	2,00			1,256		
	Teacher	381		1,77		,894	10,619	,000
	Administrator	239		1,75		,806		

On the issue of “the course contributing to preparation of the trainees for life as a contemporary individual and as a person with civil consciousness (1)”, while the administrators and the teachers have similar opinions, it was found that significant difference is arising due to the opinions of the trainees. All three groups have quite positive opinions on this issue. Only, the trainees have slightly negative opinions, when compared to the teachers and administrators on this issue. The response on the issue of “the courses contribute to the social and individual development (6)” is also somehow similar. It was found out that significant difference arose between the opinions of the teachers’ and the trainees’. The trainees have given slightly negative opinions on this issue, while the opinions of the teachers were very positive. Since the differences of opinions of the administrators were very little from other groups, they could be included in either group.

On the issue of “while the Modular programs are chosen, the regional requirements are considered (2)”, it was found out that the administrators, teachers, and the trainees had different opinions. On this issue, a significant difference was detected between the administrators and the trainees and while the administrators claimed that the courses were initiated according to the regional requirements, the trainees did not quite agree with this and showed opinions that are more negative.

The opinions given by the teachers were in between the two. A similar issue investigated was whether “the programs being initiated along with the demands of the public (3)”. On this issue, while the administrators and the teachers had similar opinions, it was found out that the significant difference arose because of the opinions of the trainees. The opinions of the trainees on this issue showed difference in the negative direction, when compared to the opinions of the teachers and the administrators’. It is useful to take the opinion of the trainees into consideration.

On the issue of “the programs initiated towards production (4)”, while the teachers and the trainees had similar opinions, it was found out that the reason for the significant difference was the opinions of the administrators. The opinions of the administrators showed negative tendency on this point and is rather concerning. In addition, their opinions fall into the region between “Agree” and “Medium Level Agree”. It will be useful to determine the reasons of this negative opinion of especially the trainees.

While the trainees and the teachers had similar opinions on “the programs are initiated along with scientific and technological developments (5)”, it was found that significant difference rooted from opinions of the administrators. The opinions of the administrators were different from the teachers’ and the trainees’ in a positive direction. The opinions of the teachers’ and the trainees’ fall in between “Agree” and “Medium Level Agree”. It is worth to identify which programs initiated are not in line with the scientific and technological developments. On the issue of “the contents of the programs cover scientific and technological developments (9)”, while the administrators’ and the teachers’ opinions were very close, it was found out that the significant difference occurred because of the trainees’ opinions. The opinions of the trainees’ were more negative when compared to the administrators’ and the teachers’.

On “The programs add lasting knowledge and skills by making and living (7)” issue, a significant difference occurred between the teachers’ and the administrators’ opinions, where the opinions of the teachers’ were more positive. The trainees gave opinions that are slightly more negative on this issue.

On the issue of “the course times are adhered to, as planned (8)”, a significant difference in opinion arose between the trainees/administrators and the teachers. It was found out that the difference was caused due to the opinion of the teachers’. The reason could be that some of the teachers found the duration of some of the courses inadequate.

*Comparison of the Trainee-Teacher Opinions*

In the trainee-teacher surveys, common opinions were received on three issues. The common opinions were tested using T-test. The opinions on “the applied sections of the courses I have participated in were adequate for development of skills” in the trainee questionnaire and the opinions on “the activities of the units were prepared adequately to reach the targets” in the teacher questionnaire were evaluated together and a small difference was detected. The trainees expressing positive opinion on applied sections being adequate for development of skills are indicators that the modules were adequately prepared for reaching the targets.

On the issue of “the duration of the program is sufficient for the course to achieve the aims(2)”, there is a significant difference between the trainees and the teachers. While the trainees found the duration of the courses sufficient when compared to the teachers, the opinions of the teachers on this issue were more negative. The different opinions of the teachers can be indicators for the inadequacy of the durations.

Table 3.

*Analyses Results on the Common Opinions*

	GROUP	N	$\bar{x}$	S.D.	p.
1) Applied sections are adequate for developing skills	Trainee	3485	1,57	1,281	,002
	Teacher	381	1,78	1,010	
2) Duration of the Program is adequate	Trainee	3490	1,87	1,335	,000
	Teacher	385	2,43	1,379	
3) The evaluation section is adequate for accessing if the target has been reached	Trainee	3425	2,17	21,193	,717
	Teacher	381	1,78	1,010	

There is no significant difference on “the evaluation section is adequate for accessing if the target has been reached (3)” issue between the teachers’ and the trainees’ opinions. However, the opinions of the trainees’ fall in between “Agree” and “Medium Level Agree”. It is useful to investigate further the opinions of the trainees’ on this issue and if needed, to revise the evaluation section. Eliminating the dissatisfaction of the trainees is important in order to increase the motivations of the trainees.

*Comparison of the Trainee-Administrator Opinion*

In the Trainee-Administrator surveys, common opinions were received on two issues. The common opinions were tested using T-test. On the issue of “the certificates given on completion of the courses are useful for finding jobs and are respected” there is no significant difference between the administrators’ and the trainees’ opinions. When the results of the T-test and the average values belonging to the groups are evaluated together, the trainees expressing positive opinions on certificates being useful to them in finding jobs, is an indicator that the certificates received from the PTCs are respected in the industry as well. However, since the opinions of the trainees’ fall into the area of “Agree”, probably they face some difficulties in finding jobs in certain fields. On this issue, it may be necessary to identify which certificates are respected in the industry and which ones are not and take some measures accordingly.

Table 4.  
*Analyses Results on the Common Opinion*

	GROUP	N	$\bar{x}$	S.D.	p.
1) The certificate received is adequate in finding jobs	Trainee	3500	2,09	1,283	,052
	Administrator	212	1,91	1,104	
2) The Teacher is using equipment in the classes	Trainee	3543	1,36	,890	,000
	Administrator	207	1,59	,807	

On the issue of “the teacher is using equipment suitable for the subjects (2)”, there is a significant difference between the opinions of the administrators’ and the trainees’. While the trainees expressed positive opinions on teachers using suitable equipment during the classes, the administrators expressed opinions that are a little more negative on this issue.

*Comparison of the Administrator-Teacher opinions*

In the Administrator – Teacher questionnaires, common opinions were received on 17 issues. These opinions are indicated in table 5. The common opinions were analysed using T-test.

There is a significant difference between the administrators’ and the teachers’ opinions on physical potential of the building being used adequately. Generally, both groups find the course buildings inadequate, but the administrators are a little more positive on this issue. There is a significant difference between the administrators’ opinion and the teachers’ opinions on the effective utilisation of the classrooms, workshops and the laboratories. The administrators look at this point positively, when compared to the teachers. There is a significant difference between the administrators’ and the teachers’ opinions on regular maintenance and repairs of the equipment. The teachers have expressed opinions that are more negative on this issue. When it is considered that the teachers are the users of this training equipment, it is useful to take their opinions into consideration. Also, both the administrators and the teachers share the opinion that the schools are putting in every effort to establish courses.

There is a significant difference between the administrators’ and the teachers’ (more negative) opinions on development of the programs according to the scientific and technological developments. It is useful to take the teachers’ opinions, into consideration and to identify the programs negatively reported and to identify which programs do not follow the scientific and technological developments. There are no significant differences between the administrators’ and the teachers’ opinions on the issues of the contents of the programs covering the scientific and technological developments, that they are renewed constantly according to the scientific and technological developments, and both groups have positive opinions on these issues.

Table 5.  
Analyses Results on the Common Opinion

	GROUP	N	S.D..	p.	
1) Physical potential of the course building is adequate	Teacher	391	2,53	1,339	,001
	Administrator	242	2,89	1,170	
2) Classrooms, workshops and laboratories are utilized adequately	Teacher	384	2,13	1,273	,000
	Administrator	242	1,60	,860	
3) Training Equipment are regularly maintained and repaired	Teacher	380	2,29	1,929	,000
	Administrator	241	1,65	,833	
4) The Centre is using all facilities to initiate Programs	Teacher	387	1,54	1,026	,391
	Administrator	241	1,46	1,489	
5) Programs are developed according to the scientific and technological developments	Teacher	381	2,11	1,156	,001
	Administrator	242	1,83	,931	
6) The trainees can find jobs	Teacher	382	2,66	1,232	,860
	Administrator	242	2,64	,976	
7) The courses prepare the trainees for life	Teacher	388	1,55	,778	,000
	Administrator	242	1,97	1,081	
8) The contents of the programs cover the scientific and technological developments	Teacher	386	2,08	1,958	,014
	Administrator	239	1,75	,806	
9) The contents of the courses are renewed according to scientific and technological developments	Teacher	381	1,70	1,039	,887
	Administrator	240	1,71	,931	
10) The contents of the program are adequate for the requirements of the region	Teacher	382	1,93	1,562	,114
	Administrator	240	1,75	,804	
11) The evaluation section is adequate for accessing if the target has been reached	Teacher	377	1,80	,878	,003
	Administrator	240	1,59	,792	
12) All equipment needed for proper operation of the program are present	Teacher	392	2,00	,000	,000
	Administrator	239	1,75	,806	
13) Unit, daily and individual programs are controlled	Teacher	380	1,53	,899	,264
	Administrator	240	1,45	,736	
14) An individual training program is prepared for each trainee	Teacher	351	2,51	1,466	,068
	Administrator	237	2,29	1,316	
15) Training, education and discipline works are carried out according to the legislations	Teacher	376	1,46	,838	,020
	Administrator	241	1,32	,572	
16) Attendance of the trainees are being checked	Teacher	382	1,26	,630	,833
	Administrator	241	1,27	,575	
17) Directorates of the National Education and local administrators are sensitive for the courses to run flawless.	Teacher	383	1,52	,868	,022
	Administrator	239	1,68	,820	

On the issue of the trainees finding jobs at the end of the courses, both the administrators and the teachers gave the same opinions. However, their opinions fall into "Medium Level Agree" region. It will be useful to evaluate this issue further. There is a significant difference between the administrators' and the teachers' opinion on preparation of the trainees for life. While the teachers were a little more positive on this issue, the administrators were a little more negative. It is pleasant that the teachers are positive on this issue.

On the issue whether the contents are adequate for the regional requirements the opinions of both groups are positive. Administrators expressed even more positive views on this issue.

The difference between the administrators' and the teachers' opinions on the evaluation section being adequate to access if the targets are reached is significant. The administrators' opinions on this issue were more positive than the teachers'. There is a significant difference between the administrators' and the teachers' opinions on the issues of running of the programs and the presence of the required training equipment. The teachers' opinion being a little more negative can be an indicator about the inadequacy of the training equipment. On issues including programs being controlled, training is carried out according to the legislation, attendance being checked, and administrators being sensitive for running the courses flawless both the teachers and the administrators expressed similar and quite positive opinions. However, on the issue of individual training program is prepared for each trainee both groups had quite negative opinions. These results show that except on this issue in general the running of the programs was found quite satisfactory by both the teachers and the administrators. Preparation of individual programs for each trainee seems the most difficult issue to be handled.

#### Discussion

On several issues even though groups (that are trainees, teachers and administrators) have some disagreements (as three groups or different combinations of two groups), in general their responses are mostly positive (below 2.33), and mostly in the range of 1.00 and 2.00. Also, the disagreements are quite small and in most cases almost negligible (with less than 0.33 differences). We have ignored these differences, and interpreted these results as the same.

Although on most issues the results of this investigation show quite positive results, there are some issues with very high positive results. That is, related questions had received "Strongly agree" opinions from all related groups. It is necessary to analyze them separately from issues with moderately positive responses. These results are the main indicators of the success of the modular programs at PTCs.

If the average of the response is more negative than 2.50, we have considered that response as negative.

Based on above explanations the main results of this survey can be summarized as follows:

1. On some issues almost all respondents had negative opinions. These are:
  - a. on the physical infrastructure of the PTCs,
  - b. on the difficulty of finding jobs for the trainees after completing the programs,
  - c. on the preparation of individual programs for the trainees.
2. On only a few issues conflicting responses are also gathered from different groups of respondents. These issues require further and detailed investigation. Among these issues one has the highest difference. On the duration of the programs there is a significant difference between the responses of the students and the teachers. Even though the students find the duration of the programs close to adequate, the teachers disagree and their response is somehow negative. The programs with inadequate durations must be identified and if necessary, revisions must be made.
3. There are also some issues received very high positive responses from all three groups, which are as follows:

a. Modular programs are offered to meet the demand of the public and they contribute the society (related questions in the questionnaire were “the programs are initiated along with the demands of the public” and “the programs contribute to social and individual development”).

b. Modular programs gave life-long learning skills to the trainees (related question in the questionnaire was “the programs add lasting knowledge and skills by making and living”).

c. For the execution of the programs, the administrators and the teachers are putting their best efforts (related questions in the questionnaire were “the centre is using all facilities to initiate programs”, “unit, daily and individual programs are controlled”, “training, education and discipline works are carried out according to the legislations”, “attendance of the trainees are being checked”, “the teacher is using equipment in the classes”, and “directorates of the National Education and local administrators are sensitive for the courses to run flawless”).

4. Considering the list of issues introduced in “The Aim of The Investigation” section to measure the adequacies of the modular programs it is determined that on most of these issues the respondents’ answers are quite positive. This result could be an indication of modular programs being adequate. This corresponds to the largest group of issues investigated and presented in the Findings section.

The following actions can be suggested in relation to the issues raised above:

- The teachers’ opinions on duration of the programs being short and inadequate for achieving the purposes and for programming properly have to be taken into consideration. The reasons of the programs with inadequate duration have to be investigated and the necessary revisions have to be made. This result indicates that either teachers are not able to cover all the subjects they intend to cover in the duration of the course or they rush and therefore, they are not pleased with the way they have to conduct courses.

- The investigation made by Ayas, Akdeniz, Aktekin, Odabaşı, Sağlam-Arslan (2007) on the effectiveness of training given in the PTCs and the decision taken at the national summit (Ministry of Education [MEB], 2006) on physical facilities of the course buildings and adequacy of the training equipment are parallel to the opinions of the teachers’ and the trainees’ and support their views on the needs for the improvements of the buildings and the training equipments for PTCs. It is clear that more investment is needed for improving the infrastructure of PTCs in general.

- It is useful to determine whether having difficulty to find jobs for trainees roots from the programs or from the lack of employment opportunities and necessary measures must be taken to deal with this issue if the main reason for trainees having difficulties in finding jobs is mainly the programs. Although the issue of trainees finding jobs is one of the main aims of PTCs, it is also expected that it will not be achieved easily. Moreover, because of the importance of this matter, further investigation must be made to determine which programs are more likely helpful for trainees for finding jobs and which ones are not.

- The reasons for not being able to prepare individual programs for trainees may vary. For example, large classes or lack of experience of the teachers might be the reasons for the negative result on this issue. Therefore, a further investigation determining the reasons of this problem can be useful to find a solution to it.

## Conclusion

Throughout this study, valuable information has been collected regarding the adequacy of the programs applied at the PTCs. In general this research has shown that modular programs executed at the PTCs are quite successful. Moreover, our findings also indicate that there are some issues that need further investigation. For example, in some programs, it is necessary to

eliminate the adversities arising from the inadequacy of the duration and to improve the physical environments. Along the findings, it is important to develop the necessary policies on these issues and to revise the programs based on the results of further detailed investigation.

We have summarized the important results of the findings in four groups. These are as follows:

1. issues with somehow negative responses from most respondents,
2. issues with conflicting responses from different respondent groups,
3. issues with strong positive responses from most respondents,
4. issues on average with moderately positive responses.

Our results show that responses are quite positive on most issues. Therefore, it is fair to claim that initiating modular programs for non-formal education at PTCs was the right decision, and even though still there are some problems that need to be resolved, the modular program approach is the correct and successful approach.

#### References

- Aitchison, J.J.W. (1993). Adult Education Policy and Provision, *The Draft National Education Policy Investigation Report on Adult Education*, Oxford University Press, 6-7.
- Cengizhan, S. (2008). *Modüler Öğretim Tasarımının Farklı Öğrenme Stiline Sahip Öğrencilerin Akademik Başarılarına ve Öğrenme Kalıcılığına Etkisinin Belirlenmesi [Determining the Effect of Modular Instruction Design on the Academic Achievement and Long-Term Retention of Students with Different Learning Styles]*, *Eğitimde Kuram ve Uygulama [Journal of Theory and Practice in Education]*, 2008, 4(1), 98-116.
- Demirel, Ö. (2004). *Teoriden Uygulamaya: Eğitimde Program Geliştirme [From Theory to the Application: Program Development in Education]* (7<sup>th</sup> Ed), Ankara Pegem A.
- Erden, M. (1995). *Eğitim Programlarının Değerlendirilmesi [Program Evaluation in Education]*, Ankara Pegem A, 4-7.
- Ertürk, S. (1972). *Eğitim Programlarının Geliştirilmesi [Program Development in Education]*, Ankara, Yelken.
- Fer, S. (2000). Modüler Program Yaklaşımı ve Bir Öneri [Modular Program Approach and a Proposal], *Milli Eğitim Dergisi [Journal of National Education]*, 147, 21-37.
- Gözütok, F. (2003). *Türkiye’de Program Geliştirme Çabaları [Program Development Efforts in Turkey]*. *Milli Eğitim Dergisi*, 160.
- Husen, T., & Postlethwaite, T. N, (1985). *The International Encyclopedia of Education: Research and Studies*, New York, Pergamon Press.
- MEB. (2006). *Globalleşme ve Avrupa Birliği Perspektifinde Türk Eğitim Sistemi [Turkish Education System under the Effect of the Globalization and European Union Integration Process]*, 17<sup>th</sup> National Education Summit, MONE Summit Results, 2, 5-10.
- MEB. (2006). *Türk Eğitim Sistemi, Yaygın Eğitim [Turkish Education System, Non-Formal Education]*, from [http://www.meb.gov.tr/duyurular/duyurular2006/takvim/egitim\\_sistemi.html#](http://www.meb.gov.tr/duyurular/duyurular2006/takvim/egitim_sistemi.html#)
- MEB. (2006-2007). *Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı Çıraklık ve Yaygın Eğitim Genel Müdürlüğü İstatistikleri [Ministry of National Education, Apprenticeship And Non-Formal Education Directorate General Of Statistics]*,2007.
- MEB. (2007). *Temel Eğitim Destekleme Programı “Yaygın Eğitim Programları-Halk Eğitimi Merkezleri” [Supporting the Basic Education Program (SBEP) Outputs. “Programs of Non-Formal Education – Public Training Centers”]*, MONE Projects Coordination Center, SBEP Booklet, Ankara. 28-29.

- Ocak, G. (2004). *Felsefi ve Kültürel Geçmişin Eğitim Programlarına Etkisi [Effects of the Philosophical and Cultural Background in Educational Programs]*, Uluslararası İnsan Bilimleri Dergisi [International Human Science Journal], 1(1), 1-13.
- Olivia, P. (1988). *Developing the Curriculum*, (2<sup>nd</sup> Ed.), Boston, Scott, Foresmen and Company.
- Ornstein A. C., & Hunkins F. P. (1998). *Curriculum: Foundations, Principles and Issues* (3<sup>rd</sup> Ed.). USA: Ally and Bacon Press.
- Resmi Gazete. (1928). *Türk Harflerinin Kabulü ve Uygulanması Hakkındaki Kanun [The Law about Acceptance of the Turkish Alphabet and Its Practice]*, Resmi Gazete [Republic of Turkey Official Gazette], Law No: 1353.
- Resmi Gazete. (1961). *Temel Eğitim ve Öğretim Kanunu [The Primary Education and Training Law]*, Resmi Gazete [Republic of Turkey Official Gazette], Law No: 222.
- Resmi Gazete. (1973). *Milli Eğitim Temel Kanunu [Basic Law of National Education]*, Resmi Gazete [Republic of Turkey Official Gazette], Law No: 1739.
- Resmi Gazete. (1982). *Türkiye Cumhuriyeti Anayasası [The Constitution of Republic of Turkey]*, Resmi Gazete [Republic of Turkey Official Gazette].
- Tampubolon, M. (2003). Non-Formal Education and Its Role in Establishing a Democratic Culture within Indonesian Heterogeneous Society. *Journal of Technology*, 38(E), 93-108.
- Taşpınar, M. (2006). Restructuring the Turkish Vocational Technical Secondary Education System Towards EU Membership, *International Journal of Training Research*, Volume 4, Number 2, 2006 pp. 72-91.
- UNESCO/UYDEL *Project Report*, (2006), 9-10.
- Varış, F. (1976). *Eğitimde Program Geliştirme: Teori ve Teknikler [Program Development in Education: Theory and Techniques]*, Ankara University Faculty of Education Press, No: 53.